
The Tree Consultancy Company
PO Box 35-284
Browns Bay
Auckland, 0753

0508 TREE CO (873 326)
TreeConsultancy.co.nz



Costing Estimate

Western Springs Pines

Prepared for	Maureen Glassey Auckland Council	Prepared by	Sean McBride Director
		Date	20 October 2020 (Rev 2)
		Job ref #	1717

1.0 Introduction

1.1 As part of the scope of works, The Tree Consultancy Company has been asked to provide high-level cost estimates for the following three scenarios:

Scenario 1. Whole stand removal, in accordance with the current consent/court order

Scenario 2. Staged removals

Scenario 3. Removing trees with risks assessed as Not Acceptable or Not Tolerable

Scenario 4. Selected annual removals

1.2 To enable high-level costs to be calculated, Mr Tim Rillstone, who is an experienced forester and arborist based in Masterton, was commissioned to help. Mr Rillstone visited the site on the 16th of October 2020. The figures contained below are to be treated as estimates.

1.3 Climbing of some trees may not be possible. This is due to internal trunk decay, wood-boring insects, the general condition of many of the trees (e.g. they are dead / dying or have biomechanical features), which predispose them to failure. Several of these trees are positioned around the southwestern quadrant of the site. The contractor awarded the works will need to confirm the exact felling methodology for these trees. Furthermore, I understand scenarios 2 through 4 will require a new consent, where the finalised methodology can be explored in more detail.

2.0 Scenario 1 - Whole Stand Removal

2.1 Undertaking the removal of all pine trees (198 total plus dead poles) at once, using the access track developed by The New Zealand School of Forestry at the University of Canterbury.

2.2 Cost: \$436,898.00 + GST.

3.0 Scenario 2 - Staged removal

3.1 Separating the removal of the pines over the three stages as identified in The University of Canterbury Harvest Plan, where each zone is fully completed. Re-establishment, including costs, is then undertaken at a later stage (months, years, etc.).

3.2 Cost: Felling Zone 1 - \$155,419.00

Felling Zone 2 - \$195,987.00

Felling Zone 3 - \$126,247.00

4.0 Scenario 3 - Not Acceptable or Not Tolerable trees

4.1 Removing all of the 51 trees that have been identified as either “Not acceptable” or “Not tolerable” risk levels, and by removing the resulting debris off-site, using The University of Canterbury access track.

4.2 Cost: \$157,210 + GST using The University of Canterbury access track

5.0 Scenario 4 - Selected removals over a prolonged period (i.e. 20 years)

5.1 Selected removal of ten trees per year. From the information provided, on average, there are approximately 15 trees that fail or require removal within the forest per year.

5.2 Cost: \$8140 + GST

6.0 Ongoing monitoring and assessments

6.1 If the 51 “Not Acceptable” and “Not Tolerable” trees are removed, ongoing monitoring and reassessment of the remaining trees will be required. Trees within fall distance of the track (and other targets) would only be retained where the CURRENT risks imposed are Acceptable or Tolerable.

6.2 At this point, it must be reinforced that there is too much uncertainty about the future behaviour of the trees and the general public. We cannot confidently say the residual risk to users of the footpath after the current Not tolerable or Not acceptable risks have been removed will be ‘Acceptable.’

6.3 In considering future inspections and assessments of the retained trees, as part of any tree management strategy, it is sensible to inspect trees for noticeable differences after adverse weather events, and the VALID risk assessment undertaken has considered the risk of harm over 12 months. That is, the reinspection cycle is annual.

6.4 In this instance, and when considering the above, it would be recommended to carry out a reinspection programme at the following intervals:

- After a weather event where wind speeds exceed 35 km h⁻¹
- At least once every 12 months.

6.5 The reinspection programme could focus on the retained trees that have the potential to strike the identified targets if the trunk snaps, or whole tree failure occurs.

6.6 Costs: \$1500 + GST per visit. This includes a site visit, brief ground-based visual tree inspection, identification of trees that may have changed in condition, and recording of data.

6.7 To undertake more detailed reporting (i.e. individual tree risk assessment and preparation of a report), could add \$1500 - \$2000 + GST.

7.0 Summary table of costs

7.1 The following table summarises the costs mentioned above.

Scenario	Description	Estimated total cost (excl GST)
1	Whole stand removal	\$436,898.00
2a	Staged removal Zone 1	\$155,419.00
2b	Staged removal Zone 2	\$195,987.00
2c	Staged removal Zone 3	\$126,247.00
3	Removal of “Not acceptable” and “Not tolerable” risks (51 trees) – Using University of Canterbury access track	\$157,210.00
4	Removal of approximately ten trees per annum	\$8,140.00
Follow-up inspection	Undertake a follow-up inspection after an adverse weather event	\$1500.00
Detailed reporting	Undertake detailed reporting from above follow up	Additional \$1500 to \$2000.00

Signed:



Sean McBride
Director
The Tree Consultancy Company